

# COLLEGE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

**Tuesday, December 4, 2018 • 1:30 p.m. – 2:30 p.m. • N-206**

**Members:** Hsieh, Bell, Hopkins, Gonzales, McMahon, Murphy, Hubbard, Young, senate appointee & Bermodes

**Attendees:** Bernard, Beitey, Miramontez, Quis, & Arancibia

Meeting called to order at 1:30pm

- A. **Approval of the Agenda (1 min):** Bell moves to approve agenda, **Gonzales** seconds. Point of discussion by **McMahon** brings up a. She states item **E.i.3.** was removed from final draft of the agenda that she sent as co-chair to the president and her secretary on Friday Nov 30<sup>th</sup> before the 12pm deadline. **McMahon** stated that this has never happened before and it is important that we get to the bottom of how that transpired. Due to the item being removed from the agenda prior to being posted, **McMahon** had to drive up to campus on Sat to post restored agenda, noting that postings on the indoor bulletin board in the N building are not visible from the outside. **Murphy** states that the chair of chairs and a counselor representative should be listed on agenda. **McMahon** asks if the time on item 3, that item that was removed from the agenda, can be increased to 10 minutes. Motion passes.
  
- B. **Approval of Previous Minutes 11/27/18 (1 min):** **Murphy** moves to table the minutes for the reasons requested by **McMahon** at the last meeting, so that we (CEC) can move away from detailed transcribed dialogue in the minutes, as it is a huge workload for any note taker but also for faculty who's dialogue has not been captured, it has created an unequal representation of dialogue in the record, and we agreed per the suggestion of CIA to stop taking minutes in this way. **McMahon** and **Murphy** re-iterated the notion to record the important issues that transpire in a meeting but not continue with the lop-sided verbatim accounts. **Miramontez** suggests sending this set of minutes to Helen Benjamin as a neutral party. **Murphy** makes a new motion to table these minutes and send them to our collegiality in action (CIA) colleagues to assist us with appropriate editing. **McMahon** seconds. Motion passes. **Hsieh** and **McMahon** agree to send the minutes via email to **Helen Benjamin** and CIA.
  
- C. **Guests/Introductions (1 min):** **Landicho, Gutowsky, L. Gonzalez, Arancibia, Kunst, Harrison, Buenaventura Kjartanson.**
  
- D. **Update from Chancellor's Cabinet (three minute maximum):** **Hsieh** reports that the college is on its way to achieving its enrollment goal for Intersession 2019 and the college is doing okay for spring 2019. The Strong Workforce Program funds distribution to the college will continue to be based on the college's outcome. The Chancellor asked for the new Vision of Success Planning document with a due date of Dec.15. Miramar College will submit on Dec. 12. PIEC will take the leadership on this. There is no number yet on how many fulltime faculty positions the College will get come February when the new money arrives from the state. **Hsieh** will continue to advocate for the College. The Board of Governors Classified Employee of the Year award will come from Continuing Education. It came from Miramar College last year. **McMahon** reminds CEC that the Miramar AS took a resolution to the BOT showing our inequity in terms of faculty and classified at Miramar. **McMahon** and the other AS presidents from the other campuses recently met with Chancellor Carroll on the topic of distribution of new faculty positions and all agreed that Miramar College would get a greater share and the positions should be divided up equitably and not equally. Miramar needs to address parity but we cannot rectify 14 years of neglect overnight so it will be incremental.
  
- E. **Section One: College-Wide Matters (Non-AB-1725)**

**i. New Business**

#	Item	Time Limit	*Strategic Goals	Accreditation Standard	Initiator
1	<b>Annual DIEC Presentation</b> (attachment) <b>Arancibia</b> discussed a number of initiatives taking place on campus over the last semester. He also expressed a need to address undocumented student issues in the dialogue and how these students can access the resources we have at the College. The College needs to have a plan for these students. <b>Hsieh</b> initiated discussion about DACA students but <b>Arancibia</b> corrects <b>Hsieh</b> that his comments are about undocumented students who do not qualify for DACA, and that these students are different from DACA students.  agrees and reminds the committee that the state does not	5 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I	Hubbard & Arancibia

**\* San Diego Miramar College 2013 – 2020 Strategic Goals**

**Goal 1:** Provide educational programs and services that are responsive to change and support student learning and success.

**Goal 2:** Deliver educational programs and services in formats and at locations that meet student needs.

**Goal 3:** Enhance the college experience for students and the community by providing student-centered programs, services, and activities that celebrate diversity and sustainable practices.

**Goal 4:** Develop, strengthen, and sustain beneficial partnerships with educational institutions, business and industry, and our community.

**Please also see** <http://www.sdmiramar.edu/institution/plan> for **San Diego Miramar College 2013-2020 Strategic Plan**

	<p>ask about immigration status in the application process. <b>Hubbard</b> says HR can provide additional funds for advertising different diversity events. <b>Bell</b> asks that <b>Hubbard</b> introduce this topic in an email, with <b>Bell</b> copied, so he has a contact when a committee comes forward looking for additional resources. <b>Hubbard</b> motions to extend the time on this item to another 5 minutes. <b>Young</b> seconds. Motion passes. <b>Harrison</b> says that the Diversity Committee voted that he was to put together a task force so they could start developing this faculty hiring plan. <b>Harrison</b> laid out points as to what the basic plan will be so that he can now go to constituency groups so they can make recommendations of who should be on this committee. <b>Harrison</b> went over the Miramar College Diversity Committee plan-goal 1-Diversity of Faculty and Staff outline. <b>Hsieh</b> asks if there is a timeline. <b>Harrison</b> says he'd like to have members of the taskforce identified by January. <b>Hsieh</b> asks how many people will be on the taskforce. <b>Harrison</b> thinks 10-12. <b>McMahon</b> asks if the constituency leaders will appoint the members. <b>Harrison</b> says yes.</p>				
2	<p><b>Collegiality in Action Follow-up Visit</b></p> <p>a. <b>Professional Behavior and Accountability:</b> <b>McMahon</b> reports that <b>Helen Benjamin</b> from CIA is shocked at the detrimental nature of how we conduct business with regard to our professional behavior and accountability, especially with email correspondence. The group of 8 made commitments to one another:</p> <p>b. <b>Email Correspondence:</b> 48 hour turnaround in email responses. These commitments have not been honored. Two examples: 1) <b>McMahon's</b> email concerning <b>Quis'</b> poor behavior at the last CEC meeting regarding the serious concern that his behavior appears to be tolerated because it was aimed at <b>McMahon</b> and assuredly would not be tolerated had it been aimed at <b>Hsieh</b> or <b>Hopkins</b> or any other administrator. There has been no response to that email. 2) <b>McMahon</b> emailed <b>Hsieh</b> to ask how the agenda items E.i.3 was removed from this agenda and got no response after 48 hours. <b>McMahon</b> had to email Chancellor <b>Carroll</b> to get <b>Hsieh</b> to respond.</p> <p>c. <b>Meeting Minutes and Agendas:</b> No longer need to be transcribed verbatim.</p> <p>d. <b>College Governance Steering Committee:</b> <b>McMahon</b> says tremendous strides have been made with regards to College Governance Steering Committee. She says there is a great team of 20 members. There is a schedule of events that will improve the understanding of college governance. <b>Hsieh</b> would like CEC to take a look at <b>Helen Benjamin's</b> template. <b>McMahon</b> says we do not need to make those decisions right now, that's the role of the steering committee. <b>Hsieh</b> asks if anyone has comments to the meeting notes from the last CIA meeting. <b>Murphy</b> says that the correspondence to the</p>	5 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	IV	McMahon

**\* San Diego Miramar College 2013 – 2020 Strategic Goals**

**Goal 1:** Provide educational programs and services that are responsive to change and support student learning and success.

**Goal 2:** Deliver educational programs and services in formats and at locations that meet student needs.

**Goal 3:** Enhance the college experience for students and the community by providing student-centered programs, services, and activities that celebrate diversity and sustainable practices.

**Goal 4:** Develop, strengthen, and sustain beneficial partnerships with educational institutions, business and industry, and our community.

**Please also see** <http://www.sdmiramar.edu/institution/plan> for **San Diego Miramar College 2013-2020 Strategic Plan**

	<p>college will take place in the form of a memo and that memo is currently being drafted by <b>Murphy, Miramontez, Young and Buenaventura</b> and the memo should be sent out Dec. 12. <b>Murphy</b> recommend against sharing the notes of the meeting with the college at this stage. <b>Hsieh</b> is once again asking if the meeting notes should be sent to the college. <b>Kala</b> says sending the notes out is a bad idea so that our issues don't get out to the general student population, most are not aware of the ins and outs, and thankfully none of what has been going on has leaked into the general population of students, and we should maintain that. Teachers have been really good at remaining diplomatic with what's been going on, so if we were to show notes without context it would add a lot more confusion for students. It's better to go ahead with the memo and leave the notes for us to look over and see how we can improve. <b>Hubbard</b> agrees and suggests that the four general topics can be included in the memo to the campus.</p> <p>e. <b>Hsieh</b> says the CEC consensus is not share the Nov. 29 meeting notes with the campus and this time and rather wait for the memo. <b>Miramontez</b> says his understanding of the email correspondence issue was not to air our dirty laundry in public meetings or over email. <b>McMahon</b> indicated no statement about 'dirty laundry' was ever made at our meetings. <b>Gutowsky</b> says as the president of SPAA that airing people in this email venue was inappropriate. <b>McMahon</b> asked what <b>Gutowsky</b> was talking about? <b>Gutowsky</b> stated we can talk offline.</p>				
3	<p><b>Changes in Practice and Treatment of Classified Professionals and ASG Leadership at Miramar College:</b> <b>Hubbard</b> states that at the last Guided Pathways meeting a discussion came up regarding the Classified working on GP work as far as where they do the work. For some reason, it was pointed out that the work had to be done under supervision and <b>Hubbard</b> argues that all the work she does is at her desk, so why can't she do it there? There are many examples of classified work being done elsewhere on campus that is not always under supervision. It almost comes across as being punitive, if you want to do this work, then these are the conditions. She hopes a resolution that works for everyone can be agreed on. <b>Murphy</b> says that we've noticed changes in practices towards faculty, but we have also seen this towards Classified Professionals and students and it is of huge concern to us that these practices stop immediately and we are following up with the Chancellor and the Vice Chancellors regarding these practices. <b>Bermodes</b> states she has recognized changes from her experience. <b>Bermodes</b> states she has multiple roles on campus and at</p>	5 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I, II, III, & IV	McMahon, Hubbard and Bermodes

**\* San Diego Miramar College 2013 – 2020 Strategic Goals**

**Goal 1:** Provide educational programs and services that are responsive to change and support student learning and success.

**Goal 2:** Deliver educational programs and services in formats and at locations that meet student needs.

**Goal 3:** Enhance the college experience for students and the community by providing student-centered programs, services, and activities that celebrate diversity and sustainable practices.

**Goal 4:** Develop, strengthen, and sustain beneficial partnerships with educational institutions, business and industry, and our community.

**Please also see** <http://www.sdmiramar.edu/institution/plan> for **San Diego Miramar College 2013-2020 Strategic Plan**

<p>the district and she says the approval process for her ten hours a week work has been burdensome. Her entire Nov. schedule now needed to be written out in order for approval of 10 hours/week, which has been particularly stressful during finals, added to all of her class obligations. This has been ongoing issue <b>Bermodes</b> has attempted to address with the VPSS <b>Gonzales</b> and dean <b>Bernard</b>, and she states that during that meeting she felt invalidated and unvalued. It put more on her plate when she is accurately reporting what she is doing for ASG but they (Admin) are not paying her for it.</p> <p><b>Bermodes</b> stated that she felt very unsupported and unencouraged; it's created a lot of challenges for her in the ASG which has been very tough. This is a change in practice that was not established, based on the written expectations (document). It was never communicated to her that she had to be on campus, in her office, at her desk in order to be paid.</p> <p><b>Hsieh</b> says that this has been escalated to the Chancellor's level, and that the Chancellor has asked various individuals at the district level to look into the issue. That is the status at this time and per the district, there will be no further comment at this time.</p> <p><b>McMahon</b> states that CIA has helped to bring all the constituencies together to share their issues. A repeated theme time and time again, is that there are changes in practices that are not done in consultation. When these issues are followed up to get clarity, we're given the run around. <b>McMahon</b> stated she is grateful for the student leadership in having faith in coming to the academic senate with this issue, so that we can support them. Leadership means you develop your own opinions about things and you are not intimidated by people to have certain opinions to be weaponized against other factions. To be playing dirty politics with students is a disgraceful state to be in.</p> <p>The students in ASG can have any opinion they want, we should embrace and foster that. <b>McMahon</b> says it's a detriment to our college not to support the ideas and concerns of students. To dismiss them, as <b>Gonzales</b> did by saying to <b>Bermodes</b> "\$50 is not a big deal" and "<b>Barnard</b> is your supervisor" – no she isn't. Leadership is about doing the difficult things that are right things.</p> <p><b>Gonzales</b> states that <b>McMahon</b> was not at those two meetings between him and <b>Bermodes</b>. <b>Bermodes</b> states to <b>Gonzales</b> "I don't feel comfortable going to that meeting today". <b>Gonzales</b> says it is important to have truthful dialogue of those who were in the room. <b>Gonzales</b> says he's has noticed a very inconsistent approach to trying to resolve issues. <b>Gonzales</b> mentioned seeing problem solving, in other cases attack, and also weaponized. He says a lot of these issues could be resolved if all parties were willing to come to the table. <b>Bermodes</b> says that if it</p>				
--	--	--	--	--

**\* San Diego Miramar College 2013 – 2020 Strategic Goals**

**Goal 1:** Provide educational programs and services that are responsive to change and support student learning and success.

**Goal 2:** Deliver educational programs and services in formats and at locations that meet student needs.

**Goal 3:** Enhance the college experience for students and the community by providing student-centered programs, services, and activities that celebrate diversity and sustainable practices.

**Goal 4:** Develop, strengthen, and sustain beneficial partnerships with educational institutions, business and industry, and our community.

**Please also see <http://www.sdmiramar.edu/institution/plan> for San Diego Miramar College 2013-2020 Strategic Plan**

	<p>starts to affect the students at Miramar College, it's inappropriate. Whatever is going on in this collegial atmosphere is now affecting the students and our leadership and is unacceptable. <b>Bermodes</b> states that she is learning her own leadership style and what she has seen in not OK. We cannot grow in this atmosphere, this is not a nurturing environment. It goes against our mission statement.</p> <p><b>Buenaventura</b> says that an element of having a respectable conversation is acknowledging that you've made someone feel a certain way. She stated that the thing we face as student government sometimes is that we don't feel like we are taken that seriously. Others are well established but student is extracurricular, but we are an integral part of this – you guys would not be here without us! <b>Buenaventura</b> asked that students be respected within this college culture. It's about being respecting what we say and being considerate about us making independent decisions as new leaders. We model after you and if there's a problem up above, it's not surprising there are problems trickling down. We don't feel recognized as a constituency or part of any decision making, when all of the decisions affect me (students) in the long run.</p> <p><b>Buenaventura</b> has seen <b>Bermodes</b> face constant backlash and hurdles and she has brought the issues to the table more than enough times. If you are not listening then nothing is going to happen.</p> <p><b>Murphy</b> agrees that we need to come to the table. The frustration from our experience is that we do bring things to the table, multiple times and there is no attempt to problem solve. The door seems to have been shut, but we still have to come to the table which is why we are here now. <b>McMahon</b> stated that we have taken the issues further to the Chancellor for assistance that we haven't gotten here, after following the venues up, the frustrating part is that the attempts behind closed doors problem solve And work things out does not resolve the issues. So we have to go higher, to the Chancellor. Currently three Vice Chancellors are examining three prominent issues.</p>				
4	<b>IEPI Building Diversity Workshop</b> (attachment) <b>tabled</b>	5 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I	Hopkins & Gonzales
5	<b>Ethnically Diverse Faculty Hiring Priority: tabled</b>	5 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I & II	Hsieh
6	<b>Enhancing College Wide Student Success Focused Communication – Video Recommendation: tabled</b>	3 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I, II, III, & IV	Hsieh
7	<b>Caring Campus and Civility: tabled</b>	2 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I, II, II, IV	Gonzales

ii. Old Business

#	Item	Time Limit	*Strategic Goals	Accreditation Standard	Initiator
1	<b>Revised College Mission Statement: tabled</b>	2 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I, II, III, & IV	Miramontez
2	<b>Spring 2019 Convocation –</b> a. <b>Follow up?: tabled</b>	3 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I, II, III, & IV	McMahon and Hubbard
3	<b>Accreditation (Standing Item) tabled</b>	2 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I, II, III, & IV	Miramontez
4	<b>Guided Pathways Update (Standing Item: tabled)</b>	5 min	1, 2, 3, & 4	I & II	Gonzales, Mc

\* San Diego Miramar College 2013 – 2020 Strategic Goals

**Goal 1:** Provide educational programs and services that are responsive to change and support student learning and success.

**Goal 2:** Deliver educational programs and services in formats and at locations that meet student needs.

**Goal 3:** Enhance the college experience for students and the community by providing student-centered programs, services, and activities that celebrate diversity and sustainable practices.

**Goal 4:** Develop, strengthen, and sustain beneficial partnerships with educational institutions, business and industry, and our community.

Please also see <http://www.sdmiramar.edu/institution/plan> for San Diego Miramar College 2013-2020 Strategic Plan

					Mahon, Hubbard, & Bermodes
--	--	--	--	--	----------------------------

**F. Section Two: Academic and Professional Matters (AB-1725)**

**i. New Business**

#	Item	Time Limit	*Strategic Goals	Accreditation Standard	Initiator
1	<b>Faculty Appointments to Committees: tabled</b>	5 min	1, 2, & 3	I, II, III, & IV	McMahon and Murphy
2	<b>Plan for College President to Respond to AS Document that has Shared Detailed Concerns? tabled</b>	2 min	1, 2, & 3	I, IV	McMahon

**ii. Old Business**

#	Item	Time Limit	*Strategic Goals	Accreditation Standard	Initiator

**G. Reports (Please limit each following report to two minutes maximum).**

- Academic Senate: tabled
- Classified Senate: tabled
- Associated Student Government: tabled
- District Governance Council: tabled
- District Strategic Planning Committee: tabled
- Budget Planning and Development Council: tabled
- College Governance Committee: tabled

**H. Announcements: None**

**I. Adjourn: 2:32pm**

**\* San Diego Miramar College 2013 – 2020 Strategic Goals**

**Goal 1:** Provide educational programs and services that are responsive to change and support student learning and success.

**Goal 2:** Deliver educational programs and services in formats and at locations that meet student needs.

**Goal 3:** Enhance the college experience for students and the community by providing student-centered programs, services, and activities that celebrate diversity and sustainable practices.

**Goal 4:** Develop, strengthen, and sustain beneficial partnerships with educational institutions, business and industry, and our community.

**Please also see <http://www.sdmiramar.edu/institution/plan> for San Diego Miramar College 2013-2020 Strategic Plan**